



**SCOTTSDALE AIRPORT ADVISORY COMMISSION
PUBLIC MEETING**

**Scottsdale Airport Terminal Lobby
15000 N. Airport Drive, Scottsdale, AZ**

May 9, 2012

MINUTES

PRESENT: Michael Goode, Chairman
William Bergdoll, Vice Chairman (telephonic)
Gunnar Buzzard
Ken Casey
Bob Hobbi
William Schuckert
Steve Ziomek

STAFF: Shannon Johnson, Management Analyst
Gary P. Mascaro, Aviation Director
Kate O'Malley, Planning & Outreach Coordinator
Chris Read, Airport Operations Manager

OTHERS: John Berry, Esq.
Joe Monks, Scottsdale Pilot Shop
Keith Niederer, Senior Planner

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Goode called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL

A formal roll call confirmed the presence of Commissioners as noted above.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chairman Goode led the meeting in the pledge of allegiance.

AVIATION DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Aviation Director Mr. Gary Mascaro reported a successful airport emergency drill on April 28. It was a great learning experience. He praised Mr. Chris Read, Airport Operations Manager, for leading and coordinating all the efforts with other agencies. A full report including video footage will be presented at the next Commission meeting.

Mr. Mascaro announced that prior to her departure from the City, Risk Management Director Ms. Pauline Hecker had secured insurance for the Airport with Chartis Aerospace for \$10,000 less than they had budgeted. The coverage is slightly broader.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

1. Approval of Minutes

Regular Meeting: April 11, 2012

Commissioner Ziomek made a motion to approve the minutes of the April 11, 2012 regular meeting. Commissioner Casey seconded the motion, which carried by a unanimous vote of seven (7) to zero (0).

PUBLIC COMMENT

No members of the public wished to address the Commission.

CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS 1 - 2

1. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Application for Airport Aeronautical Business for PDR Services, LLC., to conduct Specialized Aircraft Repair Services
2. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Application for Airpark Aeronautical Business for CSA16-ICP, LLC., to conduct Hangar/Shade Leasing Services

Commissioner Schuckert recused himself from item number 2.

Commissioner Buzzard moved approval of the items on the consent agenda. Seconded by Commissioner Casey, the motion carried by a vote of six (6) to zero (0). Commissioner Schuckert was recused.

REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS 3 – 11

Chairman Goode noted that presentation and discussion on items 3 and 4 would be combined.

3. Discussion and Possible Action to recommend approval of 3-GP-2012 Echo at Windgate
4. Discussion and Possible Action to recommend approval of 3-ZN-2012 Echo at Windgate

Senior Planner Mr. Keith Niederer noted that this project lies within the Airport Influence Area and will go before the Planning Commission on May 23. He introduced Mr. John Berry, who made a presentation on behalf of the developer.

In response to questions by Commissioner Hobbi, Mr. Berry clarified that they are requesting a non major General Plan amendment and a rezoning. He stressed that this proposed development is 2.1 miles from the end of the runway. They are not asking the Airport Advisory Commission to change its policies. Mr. Mascaro confirmed that the request is specific to this project.

Commissioner Schuckert asked Mr. Berry whether the developer will, in fact, stipulate to building with soundproofing. He indicated that they would.

Commissioner Buzzard asked how the existing residents at Windgate Ranch are receiving this proposed project. Mr. Berry said residents are concerned about maintaining property values. At the public meeting neighbors felt the architecture was too contemporary for the area. The other major issue was that residents want to be able to continue cutting across the area to access the shopping center.

At Chairman Goode's request, Mr. Berry displayed the flight track. Chairman Goode expressed concern about jet traffic flying over the area. Mr. Mascaro pointed out that the flight track data displayed was from 2004 and traffic has decreased significantly. Mr. Berry said the proposed condominium homes will be two-story with approximately 1,500 square feet. Density is ten units to the acre.

Commissioner Casey discussed the flight tracks, noting that flight patterns might change in the future. The approach and departure areas are critical to the Airport. He cautioned that as the Airport becomes busier, the risk of noise complaints will increase. He has concern about this specific area because of these reasons.

Commissioner Ziomek argued that there would never be right-turn traffic because of the mountains. He asked what the base elevation of the site is. Mr. Mascaro said aircraft would be flying at a minimum of 1,000 feet.

Commissioner Hobbi summarized that he wants to be sure the public understands the concerns. Like Commissioner Casey he is concerned about the long-term viability of the Airport. He reiterated that the Commission is not anti-growth. However the Airport attracts growth and brings vitality. Encroachment is a serious, important concern. He cautioned that in other states airports have been closed due to noise complaints.

Chairman Goode noted that the Planning Commission will also be making a recommendation and the ultimate decision will be up to City Council.

Commissioner Ziomek asked Mr. Berry what is on the northeast corner of Bell Road and Thompson Peak Parkway. Mr. Berry said everything east of Thompson Peak Parkway is in the Preserve.

Saying he has never flown that far east from the Airport, Commissioner Schuckert opined that this is a good use for the site.

Commissioner Casey remarked that turbo jets are noisy when landing, and the noise is heard at some distance, not just directly below the flight path. Even if the tower is closed at night aircraft can still land.

In response to a question by Commissioner Ziomek, Mr. Mascaro said that night landing volumes fluctuate. Commissioner Buzzard shared that he lives 2.5 miles from the center line and a little to the north. He occasionally hears airplane noise late at night.

Commissioner Ziomek said he is in favor of recommending approval of this application. He noted out that the condominium units will have insulation to mitigate the noise.

Mr. Berry undertook to use the specific language about noise attenuation from the Airport.

Commissioner Casey reiterated that the Commission must think 20 to 30 years into the future. They are not fighting development but trying to protect the Airport.

Chairman Goode said he feels the location of the proposed development will not generate noise issues because of the location of the mountains and the direction of the runway. Commissioner Ziomek added that technology may develop quieter aircraft in the future.

Commissioner Hobbi asked Mr. Berry if he has any control over the language by which prospective purchasers will be advised that the homes are near to the Airport. Mr. Berry replied that the language will be developed by the Aviation Director and the City Attorney's Office.

Chairman Goode moved to recommend approval of 3-GP-2012 and 3-ZN-2012 Echo at Windgate condominiums. Commissioner Buzzard seconded the motion, which carried by a vote of six (6) to one (1). Commissioner Casey dissented.

Chairman Goode confirmed to Mr. Berry that this does include the stipulation to noise attenuation.

5. Discussion and Possible Action to Consider Proposed Changes to the Airport Minimum Operating Standards, Section 7-5 Flight Training Services Operator, to include the ability to sell pilot supplies and ancillary items to the public.

Mr. Mascaro noted that the Airport Advisory Commission has the sole authority to approve and implement a change to the minimum standards. This item does not need to go to City Council. A tenant who currently conducts flight training services requested to be allowed to conduct additional activities to allow the sale of pilot supplies and ancillary items to the general public.

Mr. Joe Monks, owner of the Scottsdale Pilot Shop, addressed the Commission. He requested that the Commission not approve the requested changes. Since the recession started the Pilot Shop has just managed to hang on. Any additional competition could close the doors. The pilot

shop at Deer Valley went out of business about a year ago, mostly because the flight schools were selling to the general public. There is not enough demand in the north Valley to support more than one pilot shop.

He told the Commission that he can provide better service because he has a better selection of merchandise. He maintains a full inventory of all U.S. aeronautical charts. His customers drive from Glendale and Mesa and even fly to visit the store, which brings business to the restaurant and incremental fuel purchases.

Mr. Monks confirmed to Commissioner Hobbi that his business is strictly the Pilot Shop and he does not own a flight school.

Commissioner Schuckert said it is important to support the Pilot Shop. He has experienced the inconvenience of flying into airports with no pilot shop. The current system is working and he does not support the proposal.

In response to a question from Commissioner Buzzard, Mr. Monks reviewed his opening hours. Sunday opening was not cost-effective. Local charts are always available from their vending machine.

Chairman Goode asked what the flight schools are selling. Mr. Monks said he believes they are selling basic items. He carries a wide choice of headsets and sells uniforms. He does not know whether the flight schools are undercutting his prices but they are taking away business.

Mr. Mascaro told the meeting that every flight school at the Airport offers books and materials, as the regulations permit. Staff discovered that one flight school was going above and beyond. He is not aware of any others who have been flouting the rules but added that staff did not investigate every flight school.

Commissioner Casey asked Mr. Monks if he has any idea how much he is losing to the competition of the flight schools. Mr. Monks replied that he is just trying to cover his expenses for the time being and hoping that the recession ends soon. He cannot give exact numbers.

Commissioner Buzzard inquired about any complaints about the Pilot's Shop. Mr. Mascaro said there have been no complaints.

Commissioner Casey suggested that the availability of free charts online must have cut into business. Mr. Monks agreed that chart sales have dropped significantly. They are now selling iPad accessories. However some instructors insist that students learn to use paper charts first. In further discussion Mr. Monk agreed that the business is very competitive and he is also competing with online stores.

Commissioner Casey said he respects everything Mr. Monks has said and that he appreciates Mr. Monks' support of Scottsdale Airport. However he also believes in free enterprise. Mr. Monks said running the store is a full-time job. He stressed that if cannot keep his doors open the wide selection he carries will not be available to the Airport.

Saying that he is in favor of free enterprise, Commissioner Ziomek remarked that nonetheless he believes that they have a responsibility to help keep the Pilot Shop open. The closing of the Deer Valley pilot shop was a loss not only to its owner but to the airport and flying community. He asked whether it is legal to prohibit another pilot business from opening.

Mr. Mascaro said they cannot prohibit another pilot shop from opening but there is a laundry list of requirements for a pilot shop. Today's discussion focuses on whether flight training services operators should be allowed to sell additional products.

Commissioner Hobbi said he felt that for flight schools to want to sell to the public as a sideline to their core business is not really a free enterprise issue.

Chairman Goode said that flight schools selling to the general public they should have to fulfill the same requirements that Mr. Monks does with his pilot shop.

Commissioner Ziomek asked whether staff should check all the flight schools to determine whether others are selling to the public. Mr. Mascaro said staff will certainly evaluate them and make sure that everyone understands the regulations.

Commissioner Buzzard made a motion to maintain section 7-5 of the Airport Minimum Operating Standards as currently stated. Commissioner Casey seconded the motion, which carried by a unanimous vote of seven (7) to zero (0).

Commissioner Buzzard asked if there was a way to advise the flight schools of tonight's discussion. Mr. Mascaro said staff will be doing that.

Commissioner Casey inquired about the material for national flight schools such as ATP. Mr. Monks said the basic training materials are provided through ATP and students buy charts and other items at the Pilot Shop.

6. Discussion and Input Regarding Airport and Airpark Business Permit Additions, Cancellations or Revocations

Management Analyst Ms. Shannon Johnson discussed the report and pointed out highlights.

7. Discussion and Input Regarding Monthly Operations Reports for April 2012

Mr. Read reviewed the monthly operations reports for April 2012.

Chairman Goode inquired about expanding the U.S. Customs service to seven days a week. Mr. Mascaro said he and Ms. Johnson met with high level U.S. Customs and Border Protection personnel last week. They seemed supportive of the request, but they to look at logistics. If the Airport were to pay all the costs for a second Customs agent, the total annual cost of \$160,000 would be burdensome. Another much less expensive option would be to cover the two extra days through overtime, possibly with an agent commuting from Sky Harbor to meet incoming flights. This would be better for Customs and Border Protection too as they would not be losing an agent from Sky Harbor to Scottsdale.

Chairman Goode opined that Scottsdale is potentially losing business to Williams Gateway. Mr. Mascaro said there is in fact less use of the Customs service at Williams Gateway. He feels this is a positive step forward.

Chairman Goode suggested it might eventually be possible to reduce the fees, which are high compared to other airports if traffic increases. Mr. Mascaro pointed out that \$160,000 is for the

personnel costs. Office space, utilities and other components are significant expenses. The Airport's goal is to break even with the Customs service. He summarized that the Customs people at Sky Harbor are looking into the logistics and will get back to him.

8. Discussion and Input Regarding Monthly Financial Reports for March 2012

Ms. Johnson reviewed the March 2012 financial reports.

Chairman Goode asked her whether any significant expenses remain to be paid. Ms. Johnson said there is nothing major.

9. Discussion and Input Regarding the Marketing, Community and Pilot Outreach Programs

Aviation Planning and Outreach Coordinator Ms. Kate O'Malley reported the Airport website is being overhauled and will be easier to navigate. They have initially focused on streamlining the noise complaint area.

In April four projects within the Airport influence area were submitted to the Planning Department. None negatively impact the Airport.

Two children's tours were given in April. The tour season is now over until the fall, although staff is always available to meet with community groups.

Over the past year, Ms. O'Malley said nearly 1,000 pilot guides have been distributed. More have been ordered. A pilot briefing is scheduled for next week in conjunction with the tower staff.

Five voluntary curfew letters were sent out in April.

10. Discussion and Input Regarding Status of Aviation Items to City Council

Mr. Mascaro said no new items have come up since last month. Next month staff will present the proposed changes to Chapter 5.

Commissioner Buzzard inquired when the Airport Advisory Commission's comments regarding Chapter 5 will be presented to the Planning Commission. Mr. Mascaro said the Planning Commission sees it first, then it comes to the Airport Advisory Commission. He will, in fact, be presenting to both commissions on June 13. The presentation to City Council will take place in July. He noted that the Planning Commission meeting on June 13 may have an earlier start than usual and this may be the only agenda item. Chairman Goode inquired about being able to watch the Planning Commission live on Channel 11 before the Airport Advisory Commission meets. Mr. Mascaro said staff could set up the conference room if Commissioners want to view.

11. Discussion and Possible Action to Modify the Airport Advisory Commission Meeting Schedule and Commission Item Calendar

Chairman Goode reminded everyone that they agreed to cancel the July meeting. The next meeting is scheduled for June 13 and then the next meeting will take place on August 8.

FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

None noted.

ADJOURNMENT

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved and seconded, the meeting adjourned at 7:24 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

A/V Tronics, Inc. DBA AVTranz